

Totals, results, the big winner, and what the heck it all means. Time for some answers baby!

You Decided!

Scott Johns

Tuesday, April 04, 2006



- [Scott Johns Archive](#)

After 64 different match-ups and over half a million (583939) votes, we've at last got a winner. It all started back on Friday, February 10, with a special lead-on vote between first mate Vhati *il-Dal* and Commander Greven *il-Vec* to see who would get the last open slot in the contest and the chance to face Sliver Queen in the first round of bracketed voting. This match-up actually came from the storyline, where Vhati tries to take Greven out by firing the *Weatherlight's* cannons at his commander. Failing to get the job done, Vhati is then thrown overboard to his death by Greven. In the fan vote, however, Vhati got his revenge, and with that, the latest You Decide! was underway.

This time around, for several reasons, R&D wanted to get a gauge on which legends the readers were most interested in. With such a nebulous goal, "You Decide!" made perfect sense, since there wasn't any one criteria R&D was looking for beyond "which legends do the readers like?"

Before we get to the winner, here is a table of all the votes that got us here along with the first look at how the votes from each vote actually totaled up.

Date	Card 1	# Votes	% Votes	Card 2	# Votes	% Votes	Vote Total	Winning Card
2/10/2006	Commander Greven <i>il-Vec</i>	2340	35.14%	Vhati <i>il-Dal</i>	4319	64.86%	6659	Vhati <i>il-Dal</i>
2/13/2006	Sliver Queen	3861	60.78%	Vhati <i>il-Dal</i>	2491	39.22%	6352	Sliver Queen
2/13/2006	Niv-Mizzet, the Firemind	5059	78.08%	Kataki, War's Wage	1420	21.92%	6479	Niv-Mizzet, the Firemind
2/14/2006	Akroma, Angel of Wrath	4344	59.26%	Hazon Tamar	2987	40.74%	7331	Akroma, Angel of Wrath

2/14/2006	Squee, Goblin Nabob	3343	47.59%	Cromat	3681	52.41%	7024	Cromat
2/15/2006	Silvos, Rogue Elemental	3424	62.06%	Lin Sivvi, Defiant Hero	2093	37.94%	5517	Silvos, Rogue Elemental
2/15/2006	Mistform Ultimus	2295	41.82%	Mirri, Cat Warrior	3193	58.18%	5488	Mirri, Cat Warrior
2/16/2006	Phelddagrif	2395	35.54%	Keiga, the Tide Star	4343	64.46%	6738	Keiga, the Tide Star
2/16/2006	Kokusho, the Evening Star	4936	72.45%	Eight-and-a-Half-Tails	1877	27.55%	6813	Kokusho, the Evening Star
2/17/2006	Kamahl, Pit Fighter	5509	51.49%	Kagemaro, First to Suffer	5190	48.51%	10699	Kamahl, Pit Fighter
2/17/2006	Rorix Bladewing	6878	64.24%	Verdeloth the Ancient	3828	35.76%	10706	Rorix Bladewing
2/20/2006	Tahngarth, Talruum Hero	5601	55.59%	Selenia, Dark Angel	4474	44.41%	10075	Tahngarth, Talruum Hero
2/20/2006	Nicol Bolas	4987	48.77%	Volrath the Fallen	5239	51.23%	10226	Volrath the Fallen
2/21/2006	Rubinia Soulsinger	2870	27.59%	Kiki-Jiki, Mirror Breaker	7534	72.41%	10404	Kiki-Jiki, Mirror Breaker
2/21/2006	Atogatog	3207	31.25%	Ihsan's Shade	7054	68.75%	10261	Ihsan's Shade
2/22/2006	Ambassador Laquatus	4781	52.05%	Gerrard Capashen	4405	47.95%	9186	Ambassador Laquatus
2/22/2006	Godo, Bandit Warlord	2991	32.05%	Reya Dawnbringer	6341	67.95%	9332	Reya Dawnbringer
2/23/2006	Baron Sengir	4283	50.28%	Captain Sisay	4235	49.72%	8518	Baron Sengir
2/23/2006	Ink-Eyes,	5543	64.87%	Memnarch	3002	35.13%	8545	Ink-Eyes,

06	Servant of Oni		%		%		Servant of Oni
2/24/2006	Meloku the Clouded Mirror	5955	72.89%	Chromium	2215	27.11%	8170 Meloku the Clouded Mirror
2/24/2006	Ertai, Wizard Adept	3981	48.65%	Ascendant Evincar	4202	51.35%	8183 Ascendant Evincar
2/27/2006	Arcanis the Omnipotent	6245	71.57%	Bosh, Iron Golem	2481	28.43%	8726 Arcanis the Omnipotent
2/27/2006	Braids, Cabal Minion	3880	44.15%	Yosei, the Morning Star	4908	55.85%	8788 Yosei, the Morning Star
2/28/2006	Karn, #E8BE6C Golem	3554	42.43%	Mageta, the Lion	4823	57.57%	8377 Mageta, the Lion
2/28/2006	Spirit of the Night	6102	72.98%	Glissa Sunseeker	2259	27.02%	8361 Spirit of the Night
3/1/2006	Darigaaz, the Igniter	3992	48.13%	Kodama of the North Tree	4302	51.87%	8294 Kodama of the North Tree
3/1/2006	Circu, Dimir Lobotomist	4388	52.98%	Dromar, the Banisher	3895	47.02%	8283 Circu, Dimir Lobotomist
3/2/2006	Multani, Maro-Sorcerer	3887	46.64%	Ghost Council of Orzhova	4447	53.36%	8334 Ghost Council of Orzhova
3/2/2006	Dakkon Blackblade	3209	38.59%	Razia, Boros Archangel	5107	61.41%	8316 Razia, Boros Archangel
3/3/2006	Johan	1218	14.22%	Visara the Dreadful	7347	85.78%	8565 Visara the Dreadful
3/3/2006	Tolsimir Wolfblood	5103	59.75%	Sol'kanar the Swamp King	3438	40.25%	8541 Tolsimir Wolfblood

3/6/2006	Isamaru, Hound of Konda	3900	44.06%	Phage the Untouchable	4952	55.94%	8852	Phage the Untouchable
3/6/2006	Eron the Relentless	2340	26.54%	Rith, the Awakener	6478	73.46%	8818	Rith, the Awakener

Top 32

3/7/2006	Sliver Queen	7051	51.45%	Silvos, Rogue Elemental	6653	48.55%	13704	Sliver Queen
3/7/2006	Niv-Mizzet, the Firemind	10171	73.95%	Mirri, Cat Warrior	3582	26.05%	13753	Niv-Mizzet, the Firemind
3/8/2006	Akroma, Angel of Wrath	7639	65.84%	Kokusho, the Evening Star	3964	34.16%	11603	Akroma, Angel of Wrath
3/8/2006	Cromat	4660	40.30%	Keiga, the Tide Star	6903	59.70%	11563	Keiga, the Tide Star
3/9/2006	Rorix Bladewing	6844	71.51%	Ihsan's Shade	2727	28.49%	9571	Rorix Bladewing
3/9/2006	Kamahl, Pit Fighter	4314	45.07%	Kiki-Jiki, Mirror Breaker	5258	54.93%	9572	Kiki-Jiki, Mirror Breaker
3/10/2006	Volrath the Fallen	2821	35.90%	Reya Dawnbringer	5038	64.10%	7859	Reya Dawnbringer
3/10/2006	Tahngarth, Talruum Hero	3971	50.90%	Ambassador Laquatus	3831	49.10%	7802	Tahngarth, Talruum Hero
3/13/2006	Ink-Eyes, Servant of Oni	4664	58.44%	Arcanis the Omnipotent	3317	41.56%	7981	Ink-Eyes, Servant of Oni
3/13/2006	Baron Sengir	3283	41.07%	Yosei, the Morning Star	4711	58.93%	7994	Yosei, the Morning Star
3/14/2006	Meloku the Clouded	4046	50.15%	Spirit of the Night	4021	49.85%	8067	Meloku the Clouded

	Mirror							Mirror
3/14/2006	Ascendant Evincar	3329	41.14%	Mageta, the Lion	4763	58.86%	8092	Mageta, the Lion
3/15/2006	Circu, Dimir Lobotomist	4845	57.56%	Tolsimir Wolfblood	3572	42.44%	8417	Circu, Dimir Lobotomist
3/15/2006	Kodama of the North Tree	2791	33.02%	Visara the Dreadful	5662	66.98%	8453	Visara the Dreadful
3/16/2006	Ghost Council of Orzhova	3806	45.48%	Phage the Untouchable	4562	54.52%	8368	Phage the Untouchable
3/16/2006	Razia, Boros Archangel	3755	44.91%	Rith, the Awakener	4607	55.09%	8362	Rith, the Awakener

Top 16

3/17/2006	Sliver Queen	4491	57.09%	Rorix Bladewing	3376	42.91%	7867	Sliver Queen
3/17/2006	Ink-Eyes, Servant of Oni	5166	65.29%	Circu, Dimir Lobotomist	2746	34.71%	7912	Ink-Eyes, Servant of Oni
3/20/2006	Niv-Mizzet, the Firemind	6586	71.86%	Kiki-Jiki, Mirror Breaker	2579	28.14%	9165	Niv-Mizzet, the Firemind
3/20/2006	Yosei, the Morning Star	3490	38.01%	Visara the Dreadful	5693	61.99%	9183	Visara the Dreadful
3/21/2006	Akroma, Angel of Wrath	7625	81.32%	Tahngarth, Talruum Hero	1752	18.68%	9377	Akroma, Angel of Wrath
3/21/2006	Meloku the Clouded Mirror	4177	44.67%	Phage the Untouchable	5173	55.33%	9350	Phage the Untouchable
3/22/2006	Keiga, the Tide Star	4046	41.48%	Reya Dawnbringer	5707	58.52%	9753	Reya Dawnbringer

3/22/2006	Mageta the Lion	5133	52.70%	Rith, the Awakener	4607	47.30%	9740	Mageta the Lion
Top 8								
3/23/2006	Sliver Queen	4499	46.11%	Ink-Eyes, Servant of Oni	5259	53.89%	9758	Ink-Eyes, Servant of Oni
3/24/2006	Niv-Mizzet, the Firemind	4776	48.20%	Visara the Dreadful	5133	51.80%	9909	Visara the Dreadful
3/27/2006	Akroma, Angel of Wrath	7111	61.63%	Phage the Untouchable	4427	38.37%	11538	Akroma, Angel of Wrath
3/28/2006	Reya Dawnbringer	4669	53.15%	Mageta the Lion	4115	46.85%	8784	Reya Dawnbringer
Top 4								
3/29/2006	Ink-Eyes, Servant of Oni	9335	49.13%	Visara the Dreadful	9667	50.87%	19002	Visara the Dreadful
3/30/2006	Akroma, Angel of Wrath	10524	68.47%	Reya Dawnbringer	4846	31.53%	15370	Akroma, Angel of Wrath

In the end, it came down to Urborg's second-seed Visara the Dreadful vs. Hammerheim's first-seed, Akroma, Angel of Wrath. And it ended in a blowout, with the winner taking 11109 votes vs. 3404 for the loser, a decisive 70/30 smiting. Ready to find out which legend took it all? [Click here to find out.](#)



So What Does it all Mean?

Over the course of more than 2100 posts just on our own message boards, tons of theories were presented for the latest version of You Decide!, many of which took on whole groups of supporters. With all that in mind, first off, let me say that it was all real. We didn't monkey with even one vote. The totals you see above are exactly how you, the readers voted.

Now, I can't say I blame anyone for thinking something was up. First off, we obviously have a history of "having fun with" the readers, as we like to put it around the office. Second, we intentionally timed it so that it would obviously end right around April Fools. Given that the first You Decide! had been the setup for an April Fools gag, part of the fun this time around was letting people play with the idea that we were just messing with them again. As many posters put it, "Man, they already messed with us once on April Fools using You Decide, so it would be too obvious to do it again. But then, maybe that's what they *want* us to think!"

Along those lines, posters came up with increasingly intricate theories on how (and why) we were rigging things. The funniest part of this was the fact that, by total coincidence, we ended up with an all-Black/White final four, right during Orzhov Week. Readers understandably posted that something like that couldn't happen by chance. "What would the odds be?!" was heard quite a bit that week. In addition, there were other funny coincidences, such as the fact that the final four ended up with a first seed, a second seed, a third seed, and a fourth seed! Crazy and amazing, but also totally coincidence. The same goes for the regions. I was looking for flavorful equivalents to the regions in the NCAA March Madness tournament so that readers could refer to the bracket quadrants by name. I've always loved the legendary lands from Legends, so I just picked the four that didn't actually interact with legendary creatures. (Sorry, Karakas!) Some very involved conspiracy theories involving the regions (and cards assigned to them) were put together, but I can honestly tell you that it was all coincidence. We picked four regions and then just used those names for the brackets we'd already decided upon.

Now, I know we've messed with you in the past, but I promise we're not this time around. April Fools is over and a couple days past, so I'm here to let you know this time around everything has been on the up and up. In fact, this time we messed around with you by *not* messing around with you! :)

The Truth

So, here's what's actually been going on. R&D came to the web content team shortly after we got back from the December holiday break because they wanted to gather as much data as possible about which legends people liked the most, which ones they thought were the coolest, and why. The problem was, it was an extremely broad question. They weren't just looking for something simple like "which card do they think is most powerful" or "which card do they like the flavor most." Instead, R&D was looking for a broader view of how people rate various legendary creatures, and what kinds of things they use to form those opinions. Given that broad set of data they were looking for, it was a perfect opportunity to bring back "You Decide!" since that's exactly the kind of data we get from that.

And so, after almost two months of voting, R&D has exactly what it was looking for. Between the votes and over two thousand message board posts, we've got everything we need for the questions we had going in.

So what was the point of it all? Well, first off, we hope you had fun with the actual experience of You Decide! – choosing your favorites, wondering what it was all about, and taking part in the great conversations on the boards. Our belief is that even just that experience is a lot of fun for the readers. In fact, we're planning on trying out a new feature soon letting people do just that. Called "Head to Head" or something similar, the idea is to just give you fun votes from time to time to debate and have fun with. Unlike the You Decide! series, which also lead to something else, the idea behind Head to Head is just the fun of voting and debating. We'll try it out in a bit and see what the readers think. (Have a cool vote you'd like to propose? Post it in the forums and maybe we'll use it!)

But for this You Decide! there will definitely be a number of results from how things played out. Some of it's big and off in the distance, and some of it's fun and soon. First off, the stuff I *can* tell you. On Monday, June 12th, **magicthegathering.com** will host Akroma, Angel of Wrath Week, which should give us plenty of options to have some fun. As part of that, we're going to turn the mike over to Akroma and give you the chance to ask her the questions you've always been dying to know. Whether

it's story, mechanics, flavor, design, development, you name it, send in your questions for her and we'll have Akroma answer the best on Ask Wizards during her theme week as part of the festivities. However, for that one, please do **not** use the normal Ask Wizards email form for Akroma.

Instead, [click here](#) and send in your best questions for Akroma to answer. Some quick notes on that, If you like interactive opportunities like this, please only send in actual, serious questions. I love giving you the chance to interact with the site, but the more frivolous or intentionally unusable submissions people send in, the more time it wastes on our end, making doing things like this that much tougher. Also, take a moment to ask yourself if it's something we can really answer. "How many merfolk are you printing in 2007 and what do all the cards do?" isn't very likely to get a response, so try to stick to things we can *actually* answer and you're that much more likely to get to actually read your question (and its answer!) on the site.



Akroma Week should be fun, but that's definitely the smallest part of what this You Decide! will lead to. As I mentioned, what R&D was really looking for here was market research. In the process, we've learned a lot, from both the cards that did the best as well as a number of the cards that surprised people by completely tanking. For those that don't know, R&D has been playing along as well.



In fact, once we knew the brackets, shortly before we published them live, R&D had a big internal contest to see who could best predict the results. In the end it was Paul Sottosanti that got a free box of *Guildpact* boosters for coming out on top.

But, you might say, I haven't told you the rest of what happens! Well, you're right. I can't. Not yet. But here's what I *can* say. First off, there are *several* things we're going to be able to point back at in the coming months and longer and say "Remember that You Decide? Here's what we learned there, and how it led to this." In fact, that's going to happen more than once. How long will that take? Months and longer. But even if that's all I can tell you, I'm guessing that might tell you a lot.

So what does it all mean? The answer is, it's big enough that I'm not allowed to tell you. Let's just say that I think you'll be blown away - more than once. For the first big surprise, you're going to have to wait until this Fall. I'd think sometime around, say, early October. What surprises await? Share your thoughts in the message boards, see what others think, and as those opportunities come we'll make sure to let you know each time we come to one of the big things that came from this edition of You Decide!